## LETTER TO THE DANES ON THEIR PART IN THE OVERUSE OF ESTONIAN FORESTS.

Minister for Climate, Energy and Utilities, Dan Jørgensen Minister for Environment, Lea Wermelin

Members of the Climate, Energy and Utilities Committee (Folketinget, the Danish Parliament)
Members of the Environment and Food Committee (Folketinget, the Danish Parliament)
The nation of Denmark

Denmark prides itself over being among the climate leaders.

However, the Danish government has not "united behind the science" on the question of woody biomass. The European Commission's own scientific advisory body <u>limits sustainable biomass</u> <u>use for energy</u> to local wood and using wood waste and residues. Denmark is the largest buyer of wood pellets produced in Estonia. These are not local, and Graanul Invest, the largest pellet producer in the EU, openly admits that it uses whole trees and waste/residues in a 1:1 ratio, while the ratio itself has not been verified.

The Estonian Fund for Nature, one of the most well regarded and active Estonian environmental NGOs has expressed its opinion about the supposed sustainability of the pellet trade:

"The biomass harvest and exports from a country that is losing its carbon sink and is on the course of decline in forest carbon stock is not sustainable in climate perspective, even if criteria is met on forest unit level. Nor is it sustainable from the perspective of protecting biodiversity of forests: Estonian forest bird numbers are in decline and most forest habitat types are in unfavorable state despite the huge area covered by different existing certification schemes. These observations apply to certification based on Chain of Custody risk assessment and that based on a series of detailed management practices descriptions on a forest unit level alike. Both turn a blind eye on wider problems this new industry brings to forest management in general."

The Brussels-based sustainable forest policy organization Fern <u>recently described</u> the current Estonian forest policy thus:

"Estonia is logging its forests at a rate that would reduce its forest sink by more than a half." -- referring to if the current harvesting levels were maintained over the next decade -- both the industry's representatives and state's development plans support an even greater volume.

Estonia is, in fact, one of Europe's most intensive forest economies. As the EU Commission has pointed out that the entire EU-s forest sector is not sustainable neither <u>climate</u> nor <u>biodiversity-wise</u>, it follows that in Estonia these problems would be seen most intensively. And indeed, there has been <u>over three years</u> of intense public opposition to the extant forest policy.

It is widely agreed that the sustainable harvesting level for Estonian forests is around 8 million cubic meters per year. The Estonian Environmental Agency estimated in 2013 that the maximum sustainable logging volume (doubles for a climate neutral logging volume in that equation) for Estonia is 8,4 Mm3. The Estonian forest policy frame document from 1997 states it as 7,8 Mm3. An impact assessment ordered by the Estonian Ministry of the Environment and conducted by the Stockholm Environmental Institute Tallinn put it at 8 Mm3, this time regarding the conservation status of Natura species in Estonia (the impact assessment was rejected by the Ministry as 'centered on the aims of protecting the climate and biodiversity').

However, Estonian logging volumes over the last 10 years have been 10,7 Mm3 on the mean, reaching 12,5 Mm3 in 2017 and 2018. This is widely regarded as a serious problem in Estonia on various levels, starting with the locals whose life environment is changed beyond recognition and ending with purely economic concerns which the unsustainable use of a sustainable resource brings.

As four million cubic meters of our forest is exported for biomass yearly, and in the recent years Denmark has been importing over 50% of our pellet produce, this makes Denmark to a high degree complicit in the destruction of our environment. In fact, the Danish taxpayers' money is being used to fund it, albeit indirectly, through tax exemptions rather than direct subsidies, with the effect however being the same - a needlessly carbon and land area intensive energy policy. We are wholly unsure whether this is really the actual wish and intent of the majority of Danish citizens.

We urge you to reconsider any funding of woody biomass energy. Estonia is a small country which is still suffering from its difficult political past. The political support for sustainable forestry is weak due to large influence of the forest sector. The forest industry has subjected the Ministry to regulatory capture.

Estonia would get on the path of sustainability and good public governance faster with help from the older members of the democratic family, like Denmark. It would benefit us all. According to the UN's Aichi Biodiversity Target 3, also a part of the European Forest Strategy, all incentives harmful to biodiversity should be eliminated, phased out or reformed in order to minimize or avoid negative impacts by 2020.

## Respectfully

- 1. Martin Luiga, Estonian Forest Aid, international cooperation coordinator
- 2. Aivar Ruukel, Estonian Nature Tourism Association, Member of the Board

- 3. Liina Steinberg, Save Estonia's Forests, Member of the Board
- 4. Henri Holtsmeier, Fridays For Future Estonia, national coordinator
- 5. Madis Vasser, Estonian Green Movement, Member of the Board
- 6. Aili Saluveer, biologist, office manager at the Estonian Environmental Education Society
- 7. Ahto Kaasik, head of Hiite Maja Foundation
- 8. Anu Aug, head of Ohtu Nature Society
- 9. Uku Lilleväli, Estwatch, Board Member
- 10. Linda-Mari Väli, Estonian Forest Aid, communications and cooperation coordinator
- 11. Lauri Villau, DJ
- 12. Tiia Kõnnussaar, childrens' writer
- 13. Anneli Palo, University of Tartu, landscape ecologist (PhD)
- 14. Sulev Iva, University of Tartu, lecturer of South Estonian language and culture (PhD)
- 15. Tiina Urm, entrepreneur, coach, environmentalist
- 16. Kadri Allikmäe, Let's Do It 2008 civic action
- 17. Anna Hints, film director and folk singer
- 18. Jonas Nahkor, natural sciences teacher
- 19. Tanel Rander, artist and critic
- 20. Piret Räni, artist and children's' writer
- 21. Krista Kampus, ThinkTank Global Utmaning
- 22. Tuuli Reinsoo, independent artist
- 23. Peeter Laurits, artist
- 24. Andre Pichen, artist, environmentalist
- 25. Ott Kiens, Respiratory physician, Tartu University lecturer in Medicine
- 26. Kristjan Kalde, artist, designer
- Val Rajasaar, nature photographer, teacher at Muraste Nature School, journalist
- 28. Mihkel Kangur, Tallinn University, Senior researcher of Ecology, Associated professor of sustainable development
- 29. Maarja Mitt-Pichen, actress and voice coach
- 30. Lauri Klein, biologist, project manager for bat protection in Estonian Fund for Nature
- 31. Helen Orav-Kotta, University of Tartu, Estonian Marine Institute, Senior Researcher of Marine Biology
- 32. Heli Piisang, education leader
- 33. Igor Uibo, journalist
- 34. Liisa Sõmersalu, PhD candidate, Södertörn University
- 35. Grete Arro, educational psychologist, researcher at Tallinn University
- 36. Virve Sõber, University of Tartu, ecologist (PhD)
- 37. Mart Kangur, poet and translator
- 38. Dagmar Kase, vegan feminist activist, animal rights activist and blogger
- 39. Marcus Pertel, brand strategist and mental health activist
- 40. Hasso Krull, poet, translator, editor
- 41. Asko Tamme, Tartu, Deputy Mayor
- 42. Kadri Kõusaar, writer and film director, Tallinn City Councillor
- 43. Martin Oja, writer and DJ

- 44. Arne Ader, biologist and wildlife photographer
- 45. Triinu Meres, writer
- 46. Aet Annist, senior researcher in anthropology
- 47. Lea Tammik, designer, photographer, Estonian Forest Aid coordinator
- 48. Anzori Barkalaja, cultural anthropologist, educator
- 49. Aare Pilv, writer and literary scholar
- 50. Helena Läks, writer and editor
- 51. Katrin Jõgisaar, editor-in-chief of Bioneer.ee portal
- 52. Anders Härm, lecturer at the Estonian Academy of Arts and freelance curator
- 53. Heie Marie Treier, art historian
- 54. Heli Allik, translator
- 55. Alari Allik, japanologist
- 56. Joosep Matjus, filmmaker
- 57. Jürgen Rooste, poet
- 58. Laura Luide, autism and disability activist
- 59. Virve Sarapik, Estonian Academy of Arts, professor and senior researcher
- 60. Maarja Kangro, writer, Estonian Writers' Union, member of board
- 61. Margus Ott, philosopher
- 62. Märt-Matis Lill, composer
- 63. Andres Kõpper, musician and film director
- 64. Triinu Tamm, editor, translator
- 65. Maarja Nuut, composer and musician
- 66. Aapo Ilves, writer and musician
- 67. Sven Parker, artist
- 68. Jaak Johanson, musician
- 69. Mati Sepp, forester
- 70. Helena Eenok, entrepreneur
- 71. Lisette Kampus, activist, inbetween positions
- 72. Ülo Krigul, composer
- 73. Jüri Kolk, writer and translator
- 74. Lenne Rähn-Kuusik, local activist
- 75. Laura Kuusk, artist, associate professor of Estonian Academy of Arts
- 76. Rein Raud, writer and professor of Tallinn University
- 77. Mudlum (Made Luiga) writer and literary critic
- 78. Jüri Lipping, political philosopher
- 79. Leo Luks, philosopher and poet
- 80. Maria-Kristiina Ulas, artist
- 81. Siim Lill, theologian
- 82. Katrin Väli (Hallas), poet and translator
- 83. Amar Annus, scholar
- 84. Kirke Kangro, artist, dean of Fine Art at EKA
- 85. Anne Daniel-Karlsen, psychiatrist
- 86. Maarja Daniel, translator

- 87. Eeva Park, writer
- 88. Christian Aun, activist, storage worker
- 89. Ene-Liis Semper, artist and theatre director, professor of Estonian Academy of Arts
- 90. Pille Epner, Estonian Academy of Arts, Research and Development Office
- 91. Kadri Kalle, sustainability educator
- 92. Monika Mattiesen, flutist and composer
- 93. Anneli Kuusk, teacher
- 94. Laura Põld, artist
- 95. Sirel Heinloo, literary researcher
- 96. Margus Vihalem, Associate Professor of Philosophy, Tallinn University
- 97. Toomas Trapido, coordinator of Gaia Academy
- 98. Peeter Vissak, Coalition Clean Baltic (Board), Estonian Green Movement, guide
- 99. Mehis Heinsaar, writer
- 100. Kaia-Kaire Hunt, mental health nurse, Head of School of Indigenous Wisdom and Folk Medicine
- 101. Jaanus Sooväli, philosopher
- 102. Marju Unt, founder and CEO, Estonian Euromanagement Institute
- 103. Edward Mardo, poet, musician
- 104. Levo Tohva, hiking guide and entrepeneur
- 105. Johannes Säre, artist, director of Contemporary Art Museum of Estonia
- 106. Sigrid Viir, artist
- 107. Hanna Uibo, tech writer/analyst
- 108. Liis Kuresoo, forest expert in Estonian Fund for Nature
- 109. Ruudu Ulas, artist
- 110. Janno Kuldkepp, liberal carpenter
- 111. Rein Kuresoo, conservationist and writer
- 112. Eva Labotkin, artist and lecturer at the Estonian Academy of Arts
- 113. Stewart Johnson, author, comedian and educator
- 114. Jaak Rand, nature protection semiotician
- 115. Mirjam Pullerits, conservation worker
- 116. Piret Karro, cultural journalist
- 117. Janno Lepind, engineer, musician, sociologist
- 118. Mait Vaik, writerUniversity, biologist, private forest owner
- 119. Erika Renel, freelance journalist
- 120. Minna Hint, freelance artist and documentary film director
- 121. Kris Haamer, software developer and filmmaker
- 122. Berit-Bärbel Rebane, artist and art teacher
- 123. Terje Põvvat, science teacher, Save Estonia's Forests, Member of the Board
- 124. Mikk Jäger, artist
- 125. Helle Karis, grand lady of Estonian film, "the Fairy Tale Mother"
- 126. Oleg Kalinkin, web developer
- 127. Timur Sagitov, geodesy engineer
- 128. Ülle Kauksi, writer

- 129. Marit Mihklepp, artist
- 130. Marten Esko, curator and managing director at the Contemporary Art Museum of Estonia (EKKM)
- 131. Joel Arula, software developer
- 132. Nika Kalantar, museum worker, teacher, activist
- 133. Mattias Turovski, environmental ethicist
- 134. Aleksei Turovski, zoologist
- 135. Mari-Anne Philips, researcher
- 136. Laurie Hayes, instructional designer
- 137. Raul Kübarsepp, designer, entrepreneur, Digital Communication Specialist at the Estonian Fund for Nature
- 138. Mattias Luha, Board Member of Estonian Continuous Cover Forestry Association
- 139. Andri Ksenofontov, unemployed
- 140. Siim Ots, University of Tartu, MSc geology
- 141. Mari Laanesaar, Board member of Rapla County Nature Conservation NGO, private forest owner
- 142. Indrek Tammoja, musician, Living Gaia Estonia NGO
- 143. Ats Parve, artist
- 144. Günter Kits, musician, IT-expert
- 145. Maria Aua, filmmaker
- 146. Kadri Org, Estwatch, Board Member and communication adviser
- 147. Helene Uppin, researcher in education, MSc environmental sciences
- 148. Jako Kull; theologian, anthropologist of religion
- 149. Karin Reinberg, filmmaker
- 150. Sandra Urvak, photographer, lecturer of photography, Board Member of the environmental organisation Niilusoo NGO
- 151. Hele-Mai Viiksaar, literary scholar
- 152. Elise Rohtmets, writer and activist
- 153. Tatiana Stomakhina, artist, poet and translator
- 154. Edvin Aedma, game industry enterpreneur
- 155. Triin Tekko, biologist
- 156. Markus Pau, carpenter
- 157. Regina Kaasik, Interior architecture student in Estonian Academy of Arts
- 158. Merilin Kaup, architect
- 159. Ulla Alla, Estonian Young Architects Union
- 160. Carolina Pihelgas, writer and translator
- 161. Tõnis Vilu, writer and editor
- 162. Jaan Kangilaski, editor
- 163. Joosep Susi, literary scholar
- 164. Joosep Vesselov, writer
- 165. Kristjan Haljak, poet, translator
- 166. Kadri Taperson, AR activist, social pedagogue
- 167. Anu Trubetsky, board member of Ohtu Nature Society

- 168. Priidik Hallas, DJ, rapper
- 169. Siiri Alberg, teacher
- 170. Merle Tootsi, freelancer artist
- 171. Helena Ankur, ambulance doctor
- 172. Jaanika Kolk, company executive and artist
- 173. Tanel Lebedev, vegan activist and poet
- 174. Anny Drobet, vegan activist and designer
- 175. Jaan Tätte jr, musician
- 176. Aili Ohlau, Environmental Information non-profit (Keskkonnateave MTÜ) Member of the Board, private forest owner
- 177. Paula Lepparu, Eastern nature therapist, poet, activist
- 178. Silvi Lepparu, member of the Estonian Artists' Association and Estonian Painters' Association
- 179. Anna Vainu, runo singer
- 180. Indrek Vainu, Son of the Forest, environmental activist
- 181. Egon Holger Erik Liinar, Social Democratic Youth of Estonia/ Security worker
- 182. Diana Koit, artist, designer
- 183. Anneli Kaarma, private forest owner
- 184. Andres Väiko, artist, graphic designer
- 185. Ingriin Rääk, student
- 186. Kristel Birgit Potsepp, communication manager/student
- 187. Igor Ahmedov, PhD Student, University of Winchester
- 188. Risto Bakhoff, graphic designer, environmental activist
- 189. Mirjam Korsten, student
- 190. Laura Välik, journalist, Rapla County Nature Conservation NGO member
- 191. Gerda Välik, preschool teacher
- 192. Anneli Leinpere, web designer, teacher
- 193. Mirjam Zautina, Tartu University Museum of Natural History
- 194. Tuuli Dolgošev, librarian
- 195. Deivi Norberg, PhD Student, Queen Mary, University of London
- 196. Karl Patrick Norberg, PhD Student, SOAS, University of London
- 197. Triin Jäädmaa, environmental lawyer
- 198. Maaja Mäll, NGO Loomus
- 199. Steffen Holter, Research Fellow, NYU
- Ester Kangur, Publishing Specialist, Art Museum of Estonia; member of Rapla County Nature Conservation NGO
- 201. Mariann Rückenberg, writer
- 202. Tiina Georg, student, NGO Roheline Pärnumaa
- 203. Anastassia Argent, registered nurse
- 204. Urmo Raus, artist
- 205. Külli Jacobson, mathematics teacher at Värska Gümnaasium, entrepreneur OÜ Kagu Kudujad, nature protection activist MTÜ Tänu Loodusele
- 206. Ragne Pajo, Psy.D., licensed psychologist and clinic co-owner

- 207. Katerina Malat, Psy.D., licensed psychologist and clinic co-owner
- 208. Herdis Elmend, connected with nature
- 209. Dagmar Nurges, nature enthusiast
- 210. Marlen Laanep, biology student, musician, activist
- 211. Raul Steinberg, student
- 212. Dorothy Harriet Purre, financial technology advisor
- 213. Margus Ellermaa, ornithologist
- 214. Annaliisa Asveit, translator, musician
- 215. Anna Mari Liivrand, artist
- 216. Katriin Kütt, social protection MA, museum pedagogue and a sexual education activist
- 217. Elise Martin, student
- 218. Elvis Laur, DJ
- 219. Margit Lõhmus, artist, writer
- 220. Meelis Lukats, artist
- 221. Alar Adamson, farmer
- 222. Johanna Lehtmets, Sveriges Lantbruksuniversitet
- 223. Eero Barndõk, artist
- 224. Kalli Pikas, artist
- 225. Peeter Liinsoo, forest expert, entrepreneur
- 226. Tiina Pikas, artistic director of a dance studio
- 227. Ülle Gaver, entrepreneur (housing), member of the Save Estonia's Forests non-profit
- 228. Urmas Vürst, beef cattle farmer
- 229. Marko Tumanov, member of Save Estonia's Forests
- 230. Hele Kängsepp, environmental activist
- 231. Deivi Org, artist, activist
- 232. Kätlin Tamm, NGO Roheline Läänemaa
- 233. Jekaterina Kordas, actress
- 234. Rea Raus, senior researcher, Chairman of the Board, Statera Research and Practice Center for Sustainability and Regional Development.
- 235. Antti Mäss, location sound recordist for AV productions
- 236. Riina Georg, teacher
- 237. Aivar Georg, psychologist
- 238. Tiiu-Liina Knaps, doctor
- 239. Eva Loskit, family doctor
- 240. Uku Loskit, software developer
- 241. [REDACTED ON REQUEST]
- 242. Kaia Otstak, artist, philosophy MA
- 243. Pille Rückenberg, teacher
- 244. Inge Talts, doctor, MotB of the non-profit "Hiiu Tuul" ("Wind of the island Hiiumaa")
- 245. Pärt Loskit, entrepreneur
- 246. Arvi Sepp, Association to protect the sacred natural site of Paluküla

- 247. Indrek Laanetu, a representative of the Seto minority nation
- 248. Janis Alver, janitor
- 249. Triin Lepp, dentist
- 250. Ivo Uukkivi, actor
- 251. Merike Lillenberg, scientist, PhD (environmental protection), lecturer in EMÜ
- 252. Indrek Lillenberg, horticulture student at EMÜ
- 253. Hendrik Lillenberg, landscape builder
- 254. Raine Lindepuu, Gaia school teacher
- 255. Anne Arold, freelancer translator
- 256. Jana Soans, freelancer, artist
- 257. Arno Undrits, forester
- 258. Farištamo Eller, musician, teacher, activist
- 259. Robert Kulakovski, production worker
- 260. Maarika Kuhlberg, procurement manager, activist
- 261. Helle Talts, friend of nature
- 262. Katrin Ilison, a worshipper of forest and living nature
- 263. Sirje Luck, teacher and support worker
- 264. Joanna Ellmann, poet
- 265. Mart Niklus, zoologist, freedom fighter
- 266. Terje Hannus, librarian
- 267. Colin Luck, farmer
- 268. Marika Tamm, friend of nature
- 269. Anu Tähemaa, friend of nature
- 270. Laidi Kivist, friend of nature
- 271. Rainis Koovit, friend of nature
- 272. Maire Kuldmets, tailor
- 273. Laur Tooming, software developer
- 274. Rauno Rööpson, friend of nature
- 275. Teelia Rööpson, friend of nature
- 276. Eleri Lopp-Valdma, Kose municipality nature society NGO, member of the board
- 277. Mihkel Kunnus, Estonian University of Life Sciences, lecturer of Environmental Ethics and Philosophy
- 278. Reet Karro, forest bathing and nature enthusiast, freelance translator, adult educator and certified breathwork therapist
- 279. Tanel Joamets, pianist, teacher
- 280. Sille Teesalu, biologist, farmer
- 281. Elis Moormaa, friend of nature
- 282. Henri Kivist, entrepreneur
- 283. Kalev Kuldmets, builder
- 284. Mirjam Karro, personal assistant, friend of nature

- 285. Virge Joamets, musicologist, journalist, editor.
- 286. Kairi Rebane, freelancer, friend of nature
- 287. Marianna Soosaar, kindergarten teacher assistant
- 288. Eda Lahtmäe, Entrepreneur, Lifelong friend of nature.
- 289. Lauri Lahtmäe, Entrepreneur, Forest owner, Lifelong friend of nature.
- 290. Karin-Liis Lahtmäe, Coordinator of the EU Sustainable Energy Week, European Commission.
- 291. Eva-Laura Lahtmäe, Lifelong friend of nature.
- 292. Mai Krull, pensioner
- 293. Aleksander Laane, Chairman of the council of the Estonian Green Party, journalist
- 294. Lauri Takk, Monitoring Operator, founding member of commercial association Forestly
- 295. Helina Tilk, artist, educator
- 296. Vlad Ükssarv, taxi driver
- 297. Lia Loskit, friend of nature, pensioner
- 298. Liis Viira, composer, artist, harpist
- 299. Helena Trei, runo singer
- 300. Mati Rampe, miner
- 301. Olev-Andres Tinn, Member of the Board, Estonian Greens
- 302. Madli Lippur, writer
- 303. Kertu Vahtra, CEO
- 304. Züleyxa Izmailova, environmentalist, Estonian Greens
- 305. Marko Kaasik, Party Estonian Greens (deputy chairman), environmental physicist, Ph.D.
- 306. Cornelia Kotto, freelance artist and nature guide
- 307. Terje Kivist, student (social sciences)
- 308. Madis Raudpuu, fish processing worker and nature lover
- 309. Veljo Värk, composer
- 310. Lilian Reemets pensioner, forest lover
- 311. Joonas Laks, Young Greens Leader
- 312. Miimu Turi, farmer
- 313. Külli Piir, veterinarian
- 314.